



Module 4: Developing Criteria and Standards of Judgment for Students' Projects That Align with Teaching, Learning, and Feedback

Peggy L. Maki

PeggyMaki@aol.com

Education Consultant and Assessment Series
Editor, Stylus Publishing

The University of West Florida

March 15, 2007




Review Examples


- After you have reviewed the examples of scoring rubrics:
 - identify what you consider to be the most useful approaches and explain why you think those approaches are useful
- identify questions these examples raise about how to develop useful scoring rubrics

Scoring Rubrics

Scoring rubrics--A set of criteria that identifies the:

- (1) expected characteristics/traits of student work/behavior
- (2) levels of achievement along those characteristics/traits


- 
-
- Are criterion-referenced, providing a means to assess the multiple dimensions of student learning.
 - Are collaboratively designed based on how and what students learn (based on curricular-co-curricular coherence)
 - Are aligned with ways in which students have received feedback (students' learning histories)

- 
-
- Are useful to students, assisting them to improve their work and to understand how their work meets standards (can provide a running record of achievement).
 - Raters use them to derive patterns of student achievement to identify strengths and weaknesses and thus verify the efficacy of educational practices as well as those that need to be changed



Interpretation through Scoring Rubrics

- Criteria descriptors (ways of thinking, knowing or behaving represented in work)
 - Creativity
 - Self-reflection
 - Originality
 - Integration
 - Analysis
 - Disciplinary logic

- 
-
- Criteria descriptors (traits of the performance, work, text itself)
 - Coherence
 - Accuracy or precision
 - Clarity
 - Structure

-
- Performance descriptors (describe how well students execute each criterion or trait along a continuum of score levels). Use numbers or words with descriptive elaboration, such as:

- Exemplary—Commendable— Satisfactory- Unsatisfactory
- Excellent—Good—Needs Improvement—Unacceptable
- Expert—Practitioner—Apprentice—Novice





Development of Scoring Rubrics

- Emerging work in professional and disciplinary organizations
- Research on learning (from novice to expert)
- Student work itself—derive traits and levels beginning with high to low achievement
- Interviews with students or integration of them in the creation of a scoring rubric
- Experience observing students' development

Creating Your Scoring Rubric through a Review of Student Work

- Identify the learning outcome or outcomes your method is designed to prompt students to represent
- From your own students' work, describe the traits or characteristics or behaviors you expect students' to demonstrate
- Identify a student work that demonstrates exemplary achievement of those traits or characteristics or behaviors


- 
-
- In a sentence describe each of those traits or behaviors
 - Identify a student paper that demonstrates the lowest level of achievement under each of your criterion
 - In a sentence describe each of those traits or behaviors

- 
-
- Identify work that demonstrates ranges of abilities or behaviors inbetween the lowest and highest student work
 - In one sentence describe those ranges in your emerging rubric




Pilot-test Your Scoring Rubric


- Share your rubric with a colleague and ask him or her to apply it to samples of student work to see if a scorer understands your criteria and performance levels and if a scorer has difficulty with overlap in the criteria or performance descriptors you have developed.

- 
-
- Discuss that scorer's difficulties or uncertainties
 - Be prepared to discuss with the larger group your rubrics and experiences as a scorer

Pilot-Testing Scoring Rubrics to Establish Inter-rater Reliability

- Schedule inter-rater reliability times:
 - independent scoring
 - comparison of scoring
 - reconciliation of responses (more than 1 scale)
 - repeat cycle until scorers are calibrated

- 
-
- provide anchor examples for scorers to continue to calibrate them during actual real-time scoring
 - provide a third reader to address continued discrepancies in real-time scoring or a panel of others



Highly Useful Document to Assist in Your Development of Rubrics

Moskal, Barbara M. & Jon A. Leydens (2000). Scoring rubric development: validity and reliability. *Practical Assessment, Research & Evaluation*, 7(10). Retrieved June 17, 2005 from <http://PAREonline.net/getvn.asp?v=7&n=10>